

North Yorkshire County Council

Scrutiny of Health Committee

Minutes of the meeting held at The Cairn Hotel, Harrogate on 20 April 2012, commencing at 10.00 am.

Present:-

County Councillor Jim Clark (Chairman).

County Councillors:-Val Arnold, John Blackie, John Clark, Polly English, Andrew Goss, Mike Knaggs, Margaret Hulme, Shelagh Marshall, Heather Moorhouse and Chris Pearson.

District Council Members: - Ian Galloway (Harrogate) and Kay McSherry (Selby).

In attendance:- Executive Member County Councillor Clare Wood and County Councillors John Batt and Tony Hall.

Officers: Seamus Breen (Health & Adult Services), Bryon Hunter (Scrutiny Team Leader), Jane Wilkinson and Lee Humphreys (Legal and Democratic Services).

Present by Invitation:

NHS Airedale Bradford & Leeds – Mick James

Hambleton, Richmondshire & Whitby Clinical Commissioning Group – Dr Vicky Pleydell.

South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust – Jill Moulton., Judith Knapton

Bradford District Care Trust – Nick Morris.

Tees Esk & Wear Valleys NHS Foundation Trust – Martin Barkley and Adele Coulthard

Harrogate & District NHS Foundation Trust – Janet Probert, Carl Gray, Mike Holmes & Victoria Prest

Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of County Councillors John McCartney and District Councillors John Roberts (Craven), John Raper and Elizabeth Shields (Ryedale).

In attendance four members of the press and public.

Copies of all documents considered are in the Minute Book

115. Minutes

Resolved –

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 27 January 2012 be taken as read and be confirmed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

116. Chairman's Announcements

- National Review of Children's Cardiac Surgery – The Court of Appeal ruled yesterday that conduct of the review was fair and lawful enabling a final decision to be made about where children can have heart surgery. A formal response to the letter sent in October 2011 by the Yorkshire & Humber Regional Scrutiny of Health Committee was being sought from the Joint Committee of Primary Care Trusts.

- Bradford District Care Trust's Foundation Trust Proposals – The written response dated 14 March 2012 of Bradford District Care Trust to comments about the proposed governance model was tabled at the meeting. A copy of the letter was placed in the Minute Book.
- NHS North Yorkshire & York Cluster – Appointment of Interim Chief Executive – A letter dated 21 March 2012 announcing the appointment of Christopher Long, as the new Chief Executive with effect from 1 April 2012 was tabled at the meeting and a copy placed in the Minute Book.

117. Public Questions or Statements

There were no public questions or statements from members of the public concerning issues not listed on the agenda.

Resolved –

That the requirement to give 3 days notice is waived and those Members of the public present at the meeting who wish to speak on items listed on the agenda will be invited to do so during consideration of the relevant item.

118. Children's Services at the Friarage Hospital, Northallerton

Considered –

The Committee was presented with the final engagement plan for children's services as prepared by South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust. The report also sought Members views on whether additional information should be brought forward as part of the engagement process.

Dr Vicky Pleydell (Shadow Account Officer, Hambleton & Richmondshire & Whitby CCG) reported that the first in the series of planned public meetings had taken place the previous evening. The meeting had been attended by approximately 70 people and that the feedback received would be collated and analysed.

Jill Moulton, Director of Planning South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust said that the engagement plan was not restricted to public meetings. It had a wide remit that included consultation with staff working in the hospital as well as focus groups. After meeting with two focus groups the previous day the Trust recognised that it needed to strengthen the information it produced as it was clear there existed a lot of misinformation. At those meeting concerns has been expressed about the possible closure of the Friarage Hospital and paediatric services. In an attempt to reach a wider audience and to put the record straight all GP Practices were to be sent and asked to display posters that clearly described the current position.

The Chairman said that he had been present at the public meeting the previous meeting which had been well received. He encouraged all Members to participate in the process and to try to attend at least one of the engagement events listed in the draft Plan. The Chairman referred to the report and sought clarification about how the views of GPs were being sought and what research was being undertaken with regard to finding out about hospitals with situations comparable to the Friarage in other trust areas.

Dr Vicky Pleydell said that she hosted regular target events which were attended by a representative from each GP Practice in Hambleton, Richmondshire and Whitby. At those meetings regular update reports on Children's Services were provided. She conceded however that she had no control over attendance at those meetings. She confirmed that every attempt was being made to contact all GPs whose preferred

method of communication was via email and that she had no objection to issuing an on-line survey.

Jill Moulton said that she had been in contact with the John Radcliffe Hospital, Oxford and Horton Hospital in Banbury who were happy to facilitate a visit by Members of the Committee. She confirmed that she was happy to conduct a joint desk top exercise with the Committee to gather further information to support the engagement process and to arrange further visits to other hospitals if required.

County Councillor Blackie said that he to had attended the public meeting held the previous evening and based on observations made to him by people in audience offered the following comments:-

- Greater emphasis needed to be given to the first class service provided by the Friarage Hospital
- That the weight attached to presentation of each of the options was unequal and that the preferred option was presented almost as a 'done deal'
- That it would have been preferable for there to have been more than one doctor responding to questions
- That if finance was not relevant to the issues under consideration why was the figure of £2.5M quoted during the presentation

County Councillor Blackie said that the optimum number of births that was quoted in order to maintain a consultant led maternity unit was 2,600. However maternity units in other parts of the country continued to operate where the number of births was significantly less at around 1300. He quoted specific examples of this and handed a copy of his research to Jill Moulton who undertook to investigate further. County Councillor Blackie said it was important that the Committee saw the results of the GP survey as he was aware that some GPs did not support changes being made to services.

Dr Vicky Pleydell said that future public meetings would reinforce the quality of the service provided by the Friarage and that there would be more than one doctor to respond to questions.

Jill Moulton said that the figure of £2.5m was the figure quoted by Banbury Hospital as that needed to employ more doctors so as to futureproof its services. The Trust was being honest in sharing this information with the public and the Committee. If the Banbury approach was adopted by the Trust the concern was where would the additional doctors that were needed be recruited from in the light of the national shortage and how would they maintain the required skill level. Dr Vicky Pleydell stressed that the discussions surrounding childrens' services did not form part of the Trust's savings plans although any additional expenditure that was incurred would have to be found from budgets that were already fully committed and that was a choice that the Trust would have to make.

Assurances were given that both collective and individual responses to the survey of GPs undertaken by Richmondshire District Council and Vicky Pleydell would be shared with the Committee.

Resolved –

- (a) That the information provided at the meeting regarding progress of the engagement plan as provided by the Shadow Accountable Officer and by the Director of Planning be noted.

- (b) That Hambleton, Richmondshire & Whitby CCG works with the Committee on the content of a questionnaire similar to that piloted across Richmondshire GPs to be sent to all GPs whose patients might be affected by the possible changes and that the results of both surveys be shared with the Committee in due course.
- (c) That South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust and Hambleton, Richmondshire & Whitby CCG work with the Committee to identify other trusts/areas which a delegation that included County Councillors Jim Clark and John Blackie and Scrutiny Team Leader, Bryon Hunter visit with the aim of hearing first hand the problems they have encountered and what measures are being put in place towards securing a long term solution for small local paediatric units.

19. Mental Health: Hospital Services for Adults and Older People in Airedale, Bradford and Craven

Considered –

The report of the Scrutiny Team Leader inviting the Committee to respond to a formal consultation led by NHS Airedale Bradford & Leeds on proposals for the future provision of inpatient and community mental health services provided by Bradford District Care Trust. Appended to the report was a copy of the consultation document, addendum and the response of Craven District Council.

A joint presentation explaining the background to the consultation and the options under consideration was given by Nick Morris, Director of Business, Planning & Compliance Bradford District Care Trust and Mick James, Mental Health & Learning Disability Commissioner NHS Airedale Bradford & Leeds. The Committee noted that the service improvements under consideration would increase the distance people living in Craven would have to travel in order to access mental health services and to visit friends and relatives when in hospital. The Committee was given assurances that if Option 3 was chosen and implemented transport would be provided.

The Committee noted that the Addendum to the consultation document had been issued in order to clarify questions raised by stakeholders about inpatient beds occupancy levels and to provide further information about option 3. As a result the original consultation deadline had been extended to 26 May 2012 to allow people an opportunity to comment on this additional information.

The Chairman invited Ann Greene and Hazel Bullcock (who had given notice to speak on this item) to address the Committee.

Based on their experiences as service users Ann Greene and Hazel Bullcock said they did not support option 3 for the following reasons:-

- Disputed that beds in the Heather and Fern Wards at the Airedale Centre for Mental Health assigned to older people were actually empty
- Claimed that beds on Heather and Fern Wards were in fact occupied by adults aged under 65
- Commented that issues surrounding bed availability were not conducive to a patients recovery and had an adverse impact on the length of their stay in hospital
- Claimed that the lack of beds had led to mental health patients being admitted to an expensive private facility
- Commented on the high cost of out of area placements was due to the lack of beds

- Disputed that the PICU Unit which was less than five years old was no longer fit for purpose
- Commented that community services currently provided were not sufficient to meet the needs of patients.

In response, Nick Morris said that Bradford District Care Trust had more in-patient beds than other comparable organisations. Over the course of the next two years he was confident that by working with partners and investing in community services the number of hospital admissions would decrease. He acknowledged that there were problems with the current service but emphasised that any changes would not be implemented for two years by which time solutions would have been found. With regard to the PICU Unit he said that the design of the building was outdated. When constructed it had not been anticipated that there would be a higher demand for beds from women clients. As both sexes needed separate accommodation the space within the building could not be adapted to what was now needed making it unusable. He said that he was not aware of any out of area placements and concluded by inviting Ann Greene and Hazel Bullcock to participate in the redesign of services.

Based on her own observations County Councillor Polly English supported the claims made at the meeting that the beds on Heather & Fern Wards were fully occupied. Consequently she doubted whether the Trust would be able to make the savings it required to reinvest in new services as the demand for beds from patients aged under 65 would not diminish or be affected by the proposals. She asked what would happen to these patients if the changes were implemented. She referred to demographic studies in which the older population and those with dementia was set to increase dramatically asked how therefore a reduction in the number of inpatient beds could be beneficial. County Councillor English accepted that the PICU Unit was not fit for purpose but said that for people living in Craven without a car Lynfield Mount was impossible to reach. Funding for community transport was uncertain and she asked for further details about the pledge to provide transport given by Nick Morris. Finally she referred to the letter sent by Craven District Council that was appended to the report and said she was disappointed that no response had been received and that she would like sight of the business case for out of area payments.

Nick Morris reiterated that there were no out of area placements for older people but conceded that the Trust did have a problem with out of area placements for adults. Plans to tackle this were already in hand and he anticipated that the costs would be reduced by a third over the course of five months.

County Councillors fully supported the movement towards providing more services in the community closer to people's own homes. However Members commented that the consultation document contained very little information on what new services would be put in place both in terms of in-patient services and services in the community and how they would be funded.

The Chairman said that the model for community services provision in a rural area would differ vastly from that of an urban area. The costs would also be significantly higher due in part to transport. He said that he was not convinced that reducing bed numbers before investing in community services was the right order in which to introduce the proposed changes. The absence of information in the consultation document about new models of service provision meant that it was understandable that the general feeling expressed by the public at the meeting and to local members was that services were being moved closer to Bradford at the expense of Craven residents.

County Councillor Shelagh Marshall requested a list of the services being removed and details of what they were being replaced with.

Nick Morris said that following the meeting he would provide the Committee with the information requested by County Councillor Marshall.

Members said that the cut-off age of 65 imposed by the regulators was perhaps also in need of review but accepted that this fell outside the remit of the Trust. In conclusion Members said that it was difficult to offer any meaningful comments on the proposals given the lack of detail about community service provision.

The Chairman invited Members to forward any additional comments to him via the Scrutiny Team Leader. The draft response would be compiled following liaison with County Councillors, Polly English, Shelagh Marshall and John Clark and circulated to all members of the Committee for comment before being finally submitted.

Resolved –

That the Chairman, County Councillor Jim Clark, is authorised to submit a response to the consultation on behalf of the Committee taking into account the views expressed by Members during the meeting and recorded in the Minutes.

120. Harrogate and District NHS Foundation Trust Developments

Considered –

The report of Janet Probert, Director of Partnerships and Innovation, Harrogate & District NHS Foundation Trust updating the Committee on work to integrate acute hospital services and a range of community based services. The report focused on key developments concerning Care Closer to Home (that included Discharge Planning, Reablement and Stroke Services and Dementia), Ripon Community Hospital and the GP Out of Hours Service.

The report was presented by Janet Probert, who described the focus of the work in each of the workstreams. Members were informed that the event held in April to develop a vision for Ripon Community Hospital had been very successful. The event had been well attended and had generated a lot of innovative suggestions and ideas some examples of which were described at the meeting. . One suggestion had been that the vision for the hospital should focus on health and well-being as opposed to ill health. Further update reports would be provided in due course.

Members commended the work being done on Care Closer to Home and were encouraged by the efforts to integrate services and the partnership working that was taking place. Developments surrounding Ripon Community Hospital were commended by Members who expressed full support for the approach being adopted.

With regard to the Out of Hours Service the Committee was advised that the cost of the service exceeded its budget. Whilst some efficiencies had been implemented it was acknowledged that further work was still needed. Operational difficulties at Selby OOH centre had necessitated a temporary arrangement with Yorkshire Ambulance Service. The situation had now been resolved but internal discussions about whether a formal pilot should be undertaken at other OOH centres were underway as the results of what had happened in Selby were encouraging. The Committee was assured that no decision to change the current delivery model had been made and that any proposals to do so would be subject to formal consultation.

County Councillor Blackie said that he had spoken with Catterick GPs about what had happened in Selby. He said that they were opposed to a similar arrangement being introduced elsewhere as they did not consider it to be safe. In rural areas the ambulance response times were already well below target and he believed patient safety would be compromised.

Janet Probert said that the OOH Service was tasked with achieving financial recovery by the end of the financial year. Activity levels for the service were generally very low and the results of the patient satisfaction survey from Selby had been very positive. County Councillor Blackie said that the OOH Service in Selby was very different from that in the Dales where the weather and proximity to hospital were important factors. The Committee noted that during a three month pilot a doctor would be present at all times and that annual activity levels would be taken into account.

District Councillor Ian Galloway commented that further work was needed to make the public aware of the existence of the out of hours dentist service and how it could be accessed. He said that details and information about the service should also be circulated to doctors who worked in accident and emergency departments as his own personal experience suggested that this knowledge was not widely known.

Resolved –

That the progress made to date and the information provided at the meeting be noted.

121. Developing Plans for Inpatient Mental Health Services for Older People in the Harrogate Area Taking Into Account Interim Plans in Ryedale and Knaresborough

Considered –

The report of Adele Coulthard, Director of Operations Tees Esk and Wear Valleys NHS Foundation Trust on inpatient services for older people with a dementia.

The report was introduced by Adele Coulthard who outlined the drivers for change. Developments under consideration included the long term future of Alexander House inpatient service, the rationalisation of existing day services to develop a comprehensive memory management service and monitoring service, aligning the work of the Rapid Response Intermediate Care (RICE) Team and Community Mental Health Teams and more efficient case management and improved hospital liaison services.

Assurances were given that Alexander House would not close and that it would continue to provide dementia services. Only in patient services were under review and were likely to be the subject of a formal consultation.

In his capacity as Leader of Knaresborough Town Council, County Councillor John Batt, said that local residents had voiced concerns about the proposals for Alexander House. Alexander House was very well situated and there was he said rising demand for dementia services.

Adele Coulthard agreed that demographics presented providers with a real challenge and were one of the reasons why investment in community services was so important. Best use had to be made of available resources and integrating services was the way forward. She welcomed the involvement of the Committee and Knaresborough Town Council who she said she was happy to visit to speak about the redesign of services.

Members representing Ryedale welcomed the investment in the Springwood Unit at Malton and noted that the facility when complete would provide specialist care for North Yorkshire residents with complex needs. It was acknowledged that its location was not ideal for people living in the more rural parts of the County.

The Chairman thanked Adele Coulthard for her attendance and requested further progress reports that included work to integrate services between the Trust and the County Council.

Resolved –

That the progress made to date and the information provided at the meeting be noted.

That regular progress reports be referred to the Committee in due course

122. Work Programme

Considered –

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Team Leader inviting Members to comment on and approve the content of the Committee's future work programme.

The report was introduced by Bryon Hunter who drew Members' attention to the schedule of meetings and list of provisional agenda items. Members were advised that the June meeting would include additional items on NHS North Yorkshire & York: Individual Funding Request Panel and Developments at the Lambert Hospital in Thirsk. The item on Children's Services at the Friarage Hospital, Northallerton would not be considered at that meeting but would instead be the subject of an additional engagement event to be held on 21 June 2012 at County Hall. An additional meeting of the Committee was planned for the afternoon of 13 July 2012 at which the formal response of the Committee to the engagement on Children's Services would be agreed. The Scrutiny Team Leader agreed to circulate details of these changes to Members following the meeting.

Members were reminded that if they wished to comment on the Quality Account and feedback form from Yorkshire Ambulance Service to do so prior to 4 May 2012. County Councillor Shelagh Marshall said that at a workshop she had attended on the ambulance service an issue about providers making changes to services without consulting the ambulance service had emerged. County Councillor Heather Moorhouse voiced concerns about the unreliability of the patient transfer service and the affect of this on the efficiency of hospital clinics. Both County Councillors agreed to forward their comments to Bryon Hunter following the meeting.

Resolved –

That the content of the work programme and the comments made during the meeting be noted.

The meeting concluded at 1.40pm.

JW/ALJ